SOME GAPS IN THE HISTORY OF THE NORTHWEST

In the hope of stimulating study of the Northwest as a regional unit, a group of men who have a considerable share in the direction of research at the University of Minnesota in the spring of 1927 arranged for a preliminary bibliographical survey. The object was to bring together in a single file a note upon each piece of writing, published or unpublished, dealing with the Northwest. The data collected on each work consisted of the name of the author, the title of the work, and other usual bibliographical information, with an accurate note telling where the work may be found and giving an estimate of its value. Graduate students were assigned to the task of collecting the required data, each being instructed to examine works that by subject matter belong to a certain general field. The writer investigated the literature concerning this region in the general fields of history and government, and the conclusions and opinions set forth in the following pages are based upon that work. The bibliography may now be examined in the office of the bureau for research in government of the University of Minnesota.

The "Northwest," as the term is used in this survey, is understood to include all of the states of Minnesota, North Dakota, and South Dakota, and the state of Montana or at least that part of it which lies east of the Rocky Mountains. Those who are convinced that the Northwest constitutes a fairly definite region marked off by economic facts and interests would include also the northern fringe of Iowa, part of northern Wisconsin, and, perhaps, the northern peninsula of Michigan. It goes without saying that the consideration of the historical literature of an area so vast and so full of in-

1 Read at the seventy-ninth annual meeting of the Minnesota Historical Society in St. Paul on January 9, 1928. Ed.
terest to the historian is a task of considerable magnitude. It seems justifiable, therefore, to disregard wholly the source material that is available and limit consideration to works that are monographic, or at least secondary, in character. Furthermore, it is presumed that the attitude of the scientific historian is exhibited throughout.

It is one thing to collect the titles of historical works concerning a certain state, a group of states, or a nation; it is quite another to point out what titles should be added in order to block out a complete treatment of the history of that area. Both operations are necessary if historical scholarship is to proceed rapidly and with a minimum of wasted effort. The first operation has always been regarded as one of the more menial tasks of historical craftsmanship, while the second has been eschewed by all save a few of the most daring among professed historians. Attempts to point out unworked fields for historical research and possible titles for monographs may, however, become more common in the near future. The "new history" point of view has brought with it the conviction that the writing of history is a cooperative task, necessitating division of labor and careful planning. It would be an exceedingly profitable service to historical scholarship in the Northwest, therefore, if the present writer, after having made a survey of what has been written of the history of the region, could go on to say exactly what further should be written. To perform such a service with finality would, however, be the task of a lifetime of study, and would tax the most mature of historical minds. Only tentative suggestions, with no pretensions to exhaustiveness, can now be made.

The first and most obvious observation that can be made upon existing historical writings on the Northwest is to call

---

attention to the almost total absence of works dealing with the region as a whole. The only such work of importance is Mildred L. Hartsough's doctoral dissertation on the Twin Cities as a metropolitan center, which undertakes to trace the rise of the Twin Cities to their present position of dominance over the economic life of the region. Inevitably the emphasis is upon the economic center rather than upon the vast producing and consuming area that makes possible the existence of the large cities. But if there is any validity in the contention that four northwestern states are knit together by economic facts and interests into a region having an identity and problems of its own; its history ought to be written. Such a history cannot be written in a short time, and it will not be the work of one scholar. Many must unite in tracing the stages of the interdependence of its component parts, examining the factors that explain how and why that interdependence arose and why it persisted. So far, those who have written on the history of the Northwest have dealt with the individual states or with the upper valley of one of the two great river systems that cut across the historical interest as well as the topography of the area. Any discussion, therefore, of the historical literature of the Northwest must proceed in terms of states and river valleys, and, even if the history of the region is ultimately to be written, smaller subdivisions are both necessary and convenient.

Minnesota is the only state of the Northwest possessing an adequate general history — the work of William W. Folwell. For North Dakota, the most reliable work is Clement A.


Three volumes of his History of Minnesota, published by the Minnesota Historical Society, have appeared (St. Paul, 1921—26). They are reviewed ante, 4: 152—157; 5: 596—599; and 8: 78—80. The fourth and last volume of the work is now in preparation.
Lounsberry's history, which is better than its two companion volumes of laudatory biographies would indicate. South Dakota has only distinctly inferior histories of the biographical type, unless it is assumed that the earnest seeker can piece out the history of the state from the alphabetical topics in Doane Robinson's *Encyclopedia of South Dakota.* In many ways the best history of Montana is Father Laurence B. Palladino's *Indian and White in the Northwest,* although it was not planned as a general history and brings the story only to 1891. For the same period, Hubert H. Bancroft's "History of Montana" is still of value. For a general treatment of the history of Montana since its admission into the Union, the student can refer only to one or two magazine articles and histories of the biographical type. All the states of the Northwest have textbooks of state history designed for use in the elementary schools.

The Northwest is a peculiarly rich field for archeological and ethnological research, largely because of the displacement and extinction of its Indian tribes. The extinction of such an interesting people as the Mandans of North Dakota in the

---

5 *North Dakota History and People* (Chicago, 1917. 3 vols.). The first volume of this work, somewhat revised, has been published also under the title *Early History of North Dakota* (Washington, D. C., 1919).

6 Published at Pierre, South Dakota, in 1925.


8 In his *History of the Pacific States of North America,* 26: 589–808 (San Francisco, 1890).


third decade of the last century, for example, is an incident of great interest, and one that has not been made the subject of a monograph. A comprehensive survey of Indian antiquities has been attempted for no state of the region under consideration except Minnesota.¹¹ There is a very considerable gap, therefore, at the very beginning.

No period of northwestern history has received greater attention, nor is any the subject of more writings, than that of discovery and exploration. There is, however, a decided absence of comprehensive treatises on exploration; no work on the Dakotas and Montana is comparable to the chapters on exploration in the first volume of Dr. Folwell's *History of Minnesota*. Such a survey of explorations should take account of military expeditions, many of which penetrated into the Northwest before the period of permanent settlement. An allied subject is that of military forts in the Northwest. There are monographs and articles on particular forts, such as Snelling and Abercrombie,¹² but no single work essays an estimate of the part played in history by all the forts of the Northwest; and but one treatise upon any group of forts, such as the series built across North Dakota to protect emigrants to the Montana gold fields, has been written.¹³

In a bibliography of the history of the Northwest the writings on the fur trade comprise a very considerable section. A quarter of a century ago the history of the fur trade of the whole West was handled in an able manner by Hiram M. Chittenden.¹⁴ Even if that work could ever have been considered conclusive, it has since been rendered obsolete by the

¹⁴ *The American Fur Trade of the Far West* (New York, 1902. 3 vols.).
appearance of a great amount of new material. In recent years a number of trained scholars have turned to the study of the fur trade, attracted by its exceptional opportunities for research. There is as yet, however, but one general history of the fur trade in the Northwest, and that covers only the years from 1763 to 1800.

Writing the history of the settlement of a state or region is a task that seems to repel investigators because of its great complexity. Two Iowa scholars have published monographs that do much in this respect for Minnesota, but there is not even an introduction to the study of this subject for the Da-

16 A number of journals kept by individual fur-traders have been published, and a survey of the papers of one trading company, by Grace L. Nute, is to be found in an article entitled “The Papers of the American Fur Company: A Brief Estimate of Their Significance,” in the American Historical Review, 32: 519-538 (April, 1927).

kotas and Montana. Such a study would deal especially with the movement of population into the region, its character and sources, and the growth of communities. The whole history of the settlement of the Northwest, especially of that part of the region lying west of Minnesota, is practically an unworked field for research.

Some miscellaneous subjects in the general history of the Northwest that have received inadequate attention may be enumerated before proceeding to the discussion of matters that pertain to political and economic history: the boundaries of Minnesota, North Dakota, and Montana; the state capital and capitol buildings of North Dakota, South Dakota, and Montana; public opinion in Montana during the Civil War; North Dakota, South Dakota, and Montana in the Spanish-American and the World wars; the national guard in Minnesota, North Dakota, and Montana; newspapers and journalism; the pioneer newspaper; and place names in North Dakota, South Dakota, and Montana.

The history of the Northwest presents examples of all the forms of early extralegal organizations for government so characteristic of the frontier. The best-known of such organizations are the Montana miners' vigilance committees, which are only less famous than the similar organizations of 1849 and 1850 in California. The Montana vigilantes have been made the subject of many writings, but they have never received sober investigation at the hands of a student thoroughly trained in history and government.¹⁸ Vigilance activities were characteristic of the stockmen's frontier as well as of the mining frontier. In a cattle country, however, they were usually a function of the cattlemen's or stockmen's associations that were common in eastern Montana and the western part of the Dakotas during the free range period. A single sketch, de-

¹⁸ Among the best-known books on the subject are Thomas J. Dimsdale, The Vigilantes of Montana, or, Popular Justice in the Rocky Mountains (Virginia City, Montana, 1866); and Nathaniel P. Langford, Vigilante Days and Ways; the Pioneers of the Rockies (Boston, 1890. 2 vols.).
scribing one of these associations, constitutes the literature on the subject. The form of extralegal frontier government characteristic of Minnesota was the land claim association, a subject certainly worthy of a monograph. The spontaneous organization of the Territory of Dakota in the valley of the Big Sioux River in 1859 is one of the two best instances of frontier activity of this type in history. The other was that of the State of Franklin, organized in eastern Tennessee in 1784, a subject that has received detailed study and has long been an object of interest to historians of the West. The organization of 1859 is worthy of more careful treatment than is given it in the reminiscent account that constitutes the literature on the subject.

A survey of existing writings that recount the beginnings of actual legal government in the Northwest reveals that the following remain to be made the subjects of separate writings: the organization and development of the territories of Dakota and Montana, the admission of North Dakota and Montana into the Union, and the constitutional conventions of South Dakota and Montana. It may also be stated that no annotated texts of the constitutions of North Dakota and Montana have appeared.

Practically the whole field of the history of public finance in the region is in need of investigation. Such monographs as exist are without exception out-of-date, poorly executed, or prejudiced. There is, in the first place, no financial history for any one of the states of the region. Other subjects that


20 When this paper was written, the writer was unaware that Dr. Ritchey had prepared the study of the topic in this issue of Minnesota History.

require treatment for each of the states are taxation of corporations, taxation of mines, taxation of intangible property, and methods of assessment.

The history of the Republican party in Minnesota, at least up to the end of the nineteenth century, has been quite completely written. Similar work for the other states as well as the complete history of the Democratic party, especially in Montana, remains to be done. A good deal of research, also, is needed on third-party movements. A doctoral dissertation by E. A. Moore, now in preparation at the University of Chicago, together with monographs by John D. Hicks on the Farmers' Alliance and the People's party, should cover the earlier field for Minnesota. Similar work should be done for the other states. The Nonpartisan League, while it is the subject of an extensive literature, has not yet received all the study it deserves. There are no published accounts, aside from general ones, of the league in Minnesota, South Dakota, and Montana. The economic and social problems connected with its activities in North Dakota have been rather completely studied. Its more strictly political aspects, however, remain for investigation.

22 A master's thesis on "The Rise of the Republican Party in Minnesota" was prepared by George Hendricks at the University of Minnesota in 1922; the Minnesota Historical Society has a copy. See also Eugene V. Smalley, A History of the Republican Party from Its Organization to the Present Time (St. Paul, 1896).


24 A master's thesis that includes a short account of the league in Minnesota is Robert Kingsley, "Recent Variations from the Two-party System as Evidenced by the Nonpartisan League and the Agricultural Bloc," submitted at the University of Minnesota in 1923.

25 By Paul R. Fossum in his Agrarian Movement in North Dakota (Johns Hopkins University, Studies in Historical and Political Science, series 43, no. 1 — 1925) — reviewed ante, 6: 382-384.
Other subjects in the political history of the Northwest that have been studied not at all or inadequately may be enumerated: administrative reorganization in the states; the budget system in the Dakotas and Montana; the supreme court in each of the states; presidential, Congressional, and other elections; the election laws of North Dakota, South Dakota, and Montana; woman suffrage in North Dakota, South Dakota, and Montana; the formation of counties in Minnesota, South Dakota, and Montana; law codes; and the initiative, referendum, and recall.

A great deal of research remains to be done in the history of agriculture in the Northwest. As a preliminary, a thorough study should be made of the history of public lands and speculation in their sale. There is no history of agriculture for any one of the states except Minnesota. The history of agriculture in the Red River Valley is, however, well written for the period up to about 1905. Many monographs and articles deal with special periods in the history of agriculture, others treat of special phases of that history, while still others

26 See Edward V. Robinson, Early Economic Conditions and the Development of Agriculture in Minnesota (University of Minnesota, Studies in the Social Sciences, no. 3 —1915) — reviewed ante, 1: 277.


29 For example, Henrietta M. Larson, The Wheat Market and the Farmer in Minnesota, 1858-1900 (Columbia University, Studies in History,
deal with subindustries, or are general in character. Taken all together the works that have been written on the history of agriculture do not cover the entire field. At least the following subjects remain for investigation: pioneer agriculture in South Dakota, dairying in the Northwest, dry farming in the Northwest, and farmers' cooperative stores.

The history of banking in the Northwest has not yet been written adequately. There is no satisfactory history of banking for any one of the Northwest states, although one for North Dakota is reported in progress as a doctoral dissertation. In addition, the Northwest offers opportunity for two studies in pioneer banking, namely, the banking activities of fur companies, and methods of banking in pioneer mining camps.


Two important works are N. S. B. Gras, A History of Agriculture in Europe and America (New York, 1925); and Albert H. Sanford, The Story of Agriculture in the United States (Boston, 1916).

A beginning has been made in this field for Minnesota in Sydney A. Patchin, "The Development of Banking in Minnesota," ante, 2: 111–168 (August, 1917). The "Economic History of Banking in North Dakota" is the title of a thesis by O. E. Heskin, now in preparation at the University of Minnesota.

The first subject is touched upon by Patchin, ante, 2: 111–119, and by Adolph O. Eliason in an article on "The Beginning of Banking in Minnesota," in the Minnesota Historical Collections, 12: 671–690 (1908); the second is treated inadequately in a sketch by Harrison A. Trexler entitled "Gold-dust and Greenbacks in Early Montana," in the Overland Monthly, 70: 63–67 (July, 1917).
There is no monograph that can be regarded as a satisfactory history of the lumber industry in Minnesota. The writings on the subject are mainly the reminiscences of lumbermen, which will be highly valuable to the historian of the industry. The story of lumbering in Montana also remains to be written.

The history of iron mining in Minnesota has been written for the period to about 1900. The recent history of the industry is in need of investigation, as is also the entire history of quarrying in Minnesota. There is no monograph on the development of the lignite fields in North Dakota. There is an extensive literature on the Black Hills region of South Dakota, with the emphasis always upon mining, but no one has written a comprehensive monograph on the history of mining in the Black Hills. In the great mass of writings dealing with mining in Montana only a very few represent the work of well-trained scholars. It is nevertheless true that the history of gold mining in Montana has been well studied in

34 E. G. Cheyney's article on "The Development of the Lumber Industry in Minnesota," in the Journal of Geography, 14: 189-195 (February, 1916), is a mere sketch; and a master's thesis submitted at the University of Minnesota in 1926 by Donald W. Snell, entitled "An Introduction to the History of Lumbering in Minnesota," is quite inadequate.


its social and cultural aspects. The economic history of gold mining in Montana and the history of copper mining in Montana remain to be written.

Some attention has been given to the history of early roads and trails in the Northwest. There is, however, need for a survey of early roads and trails in each of the states. Some early roads, perhaps, are worthy of separate treatment, such as has been accorded the Bozeman Trail leading into Montana. As for the recent history of roads and road-building, together with the development of motor transportation, the Northwest, in common with practically all other sections of the United States, has no historical study.

The history of transportation on the Mississippi River before the advent of the steamboat has been admirably written. A considerable number of published works deal with the history of steamboating on the upper Mississippi. Some of them are monographic in character, but the greater number are memoirs of river men. None of these works, nor indeed all of them considered together, constitute a history of steamboating on the upper Mississippi. The writing of such a work is a task that awaits the hand of an historian who is willing to spare neither time nor energy in the study of a definitely marked off period that cannot fail to hold its lessons in transportation policy for all time. The history of steamboating on other Minnesota rivers is likewise largely unwritten. The history of

37 In Trimble, *The Mining Advance*.
39 By Grace R. Hebard and E. A. Brininstool in *The Bozeman Trail* (Cleveland, 1922. 2 vols.).
transportation on the Missouri River, in its larger aspects, has been studied by three scholars.\(^{42}\)

It is well known that the history of railroads in all parts of the United States is a subject sadly in need of research.\(^{43}\) There are histories of single railway systems lying wholly or partly in the Northwest,\(^{44}\) but few of them can be regarded as satisfactory and the subject in general for this region is almost an unworked field. An allied subject in need of study is the history of the telegraph and the telephone.

When all the special topics in the field of transportation have been thoroughly investigated, it will be time to ask for comprehensive histories of transportation within each of the states of the Northwest, or within the region as a whole.

It must have been noticed that more gaps have been pointed out for North Dakota, South Dakota, and Montana than for Minnesota. It is, of course, true that the history of Minnesota has been much more thoroughly investigated and written than that of any other state of the Northwest. Much yet remains to be done, however, for all the states, and above all are needed historical studies that do not stop at state boundaries, but consider a larger area — the northwest central region.

JOSEPH R. STARR

University of Minnesota
Minneapolis

\(^{42}\) Philip E. Chappell, History of the Missouri River, is printed as a separate volume and also in the Kansas State Historical Society, Transactions, 9:237-294 (1906). See also Hiram M. Chittenden, History of Early Steamboat Navigation on the Missouri River (New York, 1903. 2 vols.); and Joseph M. Hanson, The Conquest of the Missouri: Being the Story of the Life and Exploits of Captain Grant Marsh (Chicago, 1909).

\(^{43}\) The only general railroad histories that have been published are John Moody, The Railroad Builders: A Chronicle of the Welding of the States (Chronicles of America Series, vol. 38 — New Haven, 1921); and Robert E. Riegel, The Story of the Western Railroads (New York, 1926) — reviewed ante, 8: 83.

\(^{44}\) The best of these are Judson W. Bishop, "History of the St. Paul and Sioux City Railroad, 1864-1881," in Minnesota Historical Collections, 10:399-415 (part I — 1905); and Eugene V. Smalley, History of the Northern Pacific Railroad (New York, 1883).